# Audit Committee Annual Report 2015/16



The City of Cardiff Council

## The Ten General Principles of Public Life

#### Selflessness

Members should serve only the public interest and should never improperly confer an advantage or disadvantage on any person.

### **Personal Judgement**

Members may take account of the views of others, including their political groups, but should reach their own conclusions on the issues before them and act in accordance with those conclusions.

### **Honesty and Integrity**

Members should not place themselves in situations where their honesty and integrity may be questioned, should not behave improperly, and should on all occasions avoid the appearance of such behaviour.

### **Respect for Others**

Members should promote equality by not discriminating unlawfully against any person, and by treating people with respect, regardless of their race, age, religion, gender, sexual orientation or disability. They should respect the impartiality and integrity of the authority's statutory officers and its other employees.

#### Objectivity

Members should make decisions on merit, including when making appointments, awarding contracts, or recommending individuals for rewards or benefit.

### **Duty to Uphold the Law**

Members should uphold the law and, on all occasions, act in accordance with the trust that the public is entitled to place in them.

### **Accountability**

Members should be accountable to the public for their actions and the manner in which they carry out their responsibilities, and should cooperate fully and honestly with any scrutiny appropriate to their particular office.

### **Stewardship**

Members should do whatever they are able to do to ensure that their authorities use their resources prudently, and in accordance with the law.

#### **Openness**

Members should be as open as possible about their actions and those of their authority, and should be prepared to give reasons for those actions.

#### Leadership

Members should promote and support these principles by leadership, and by example, and should act in a way that secures or preserves public confidence.

'Nolan Committee on Standards in Public Life'

# **Contents**

1.	Foreword by Ian Arundale, Chairperson of the Committee	4	
2.	The Role of the Audit Committee	5	
3.	Our Work in 2015/16	7	
4.	Standard Items	7	
5.	Non-Standard Reports	11	
6.	Audit Committee Self-Assessment	14	
7.	Key Observations 2015/16	14	
8.	Opinion of the Audit Committee 2015/16	15	
9.	Looking Ahead to 2016/17	18	
10	. Audit Committee Membership 2015/16	18	
11	. Attendance in 2015/16	19	
12	. Audit Committee Contacts	20	
Annex 1 - Audit Committee's Self-Assessment – Updated Position (February 16)			
An	nex 2 - Audit Committee Member Profiles	26	

Page

### 1. Foreword by Ian Arundale, Chairperson of the Committee

I am pleased to present this report which provides an overview of the Audit Committee's work during the municipal year 2015/16. It is my first Audit Committee Annual Report since taking over the role of Chairperson in June 2015.

This Municipal year has seen the departure of key Members and Officers, including Sir Jon Shortridge (Chairperson), Marie Rosenthal (Corporate Director - Governance & Legal Services) and Derek King (Audit & Risk Manager) all of whom have provided a tremendous service to the Audit Committee. I would like to acknowledge their efforts and thank them, on behalf of the Audit Committee, for their highly valued services.

I wish to record my thanks to all Elected Members and the Independent Lay Members who have served on the Committee this year. Members from across the political groups have come together in an extremely effective way in our five meetings this year. It is also very encouraging to report well attended meetings, given how busy members are in fulfilling other roles and responsibilities.

Throughout the year Audit Committee has continued to receive highly valued professional support from Accountancy, External Audit (Wales Audit Office), Internal Audit, Treasury Management and Improvement & Information Management. Additionally, we have invited officers to attend Committee to respond to concerns raised by Members or identified through various Committee reports, such as internal and external audit reports.

We have reviewed our work programme at each Committee meeting, taking account of changing risks and priorities through the reports and information we receive from Members, Officers, external stakeholders and other Committees of the Council. Our Work Programme has been extremely busy this year with a wide range of issues brought before the Committee.

We acknowledge the broad remit of our role and have reflected on the effectiveness of governance, risk management and control at all organisational levels in providing an overall assurance opinion and informing the Council's Annual Governance Statement 2015/16.

We have considered comments from the Wales Audit Office regarding the need for a more streamlined process for Committee meetings, and have taken a number of actions to improve our focus. These include holding informal discussions before formal meetings, the creation of a Member's SharePoint reference site and greater use of email for sharing information. In addition, through collaboration with Scrutiny Services, we have developed a protocol for complimentary working and understanding between our respective Committees. We will reconsider our performance through a new Audit Committee Self-Assessment review in September 2016.

In looking forward to 2016/17 and beyond, in the context of continued financial pressures facing the Council, reshaping of services, new models of service delivery and a growing demand for public services, the importance of an effective Audit Committee remains critical. In February 2016, Committee Members considered the Welsh Government's draft Local Government (Wales) Bill proposals, which will see the Audit Committee renamed as 'Corporate Governance and Audit Committee'.

The Audit Committee welcomes the anticipated widening of its roles and responsibilities from the Local Government (Wales) Bill. Having recently received a report from the Monitoring Officer and participated in Cardiff Council's consultation response, we will keep a watching brief on the implementation of the Bill.

Cardiff Council can take some assurance from the positive improvement steps recognised in the Corporate Assessment Follow On, issued by the Wales Audit Office in February 2016. However, there is still much to do to embed change and improvement within the Council. There is a need for the Council to continue to work hard to fulfil its responsibilities and to ensure robust arrangements are in place for effective governance, risk management and control which are essential to ensure sustained improvements.

### 2. The Role of the Audit Committee

The Audit Committee is a key component of the City of Cardiff Council's corporate governance. It provides an independent and high-level focus on the audit, assurance and reporting arrangements that underpin good governance and financial standards.

The Local Government (Wales) Measure 2011 requires a Local Authority to have a Committee which provides independent assurance to the Members of the Council with regard to governance, risk management and internal control frameworks; and oversees the financial reporting and annual governance statement processes. Audit Committee also oversees internal audit and external audit, helping to ensure efficient and effective assurance arrangements are in place.

The Measure requires an Audit Committee to be established that includes Independent Lay Members. The City of Cardiff Council determined that the membership of its Audit Committee would be twelve Members; eight Elected Members and four Independent Lay Members, which meets the requirement of the proposed new Local Government (Wales) Bill.

Specifically, the Terms of Reference of the Committee embraces the following:

#### Governance, Risk & Control

- To consider the Council's corporate governance arrangements against the good governance framework by way of the process of compiling the Annual Governance Statement.
- To review the Annual Governance Statement prior to approval and consider whether it
  properly reflects the risk environment and supporting assurances, taking into account the
  internal audit opinion on the overall adequacy and effectiveness of the Council's
  framework of governance, risk and internal control.
- To consider the Council's framework of assurance and ensure that it adequately addresses the risk and priorities of the Council.
- To monitor and scrutinise the effective development and operation of the risk management arrangements within the Council.
- To oversee progress in addressing risk-related issues reported to the Committee, such as the Corporate Risk Register.
- To consider any Anti-Fraud strategies, policies or procedures.

#### Internal Audit

- To approve the Internal Audit Strategy comprising the risk-based internal audit plan, containing the internal audit resources (resources include; Audit, Investigations, Risk & Governance and Programme and Project Assurance Teams).
- To approve significant changes to the risk-based internal audit plan and resource requirements.
- To consider reports from the Audit Manager on Internal Audit's performance during the year e.g. progress reports.

- To consider the Audit Manager's Annual Report, including the statement of conformance with the Public Sector Internal Audit Standards 2013 and the results of the Quality Assurance and Improvement Programme that supports the statement. Fundamental to the annual report is the overall opinion on the adequacy and effectiveness of the Council's framework of governance, risk management and internal control together with a summary of the work supporting the opinion.
- To receive summaries of specific internal audit reports in accordance with agreed protocols.
- To receive reports on fraud prevention and detection initiatives and updates to any related policies and strategies.
- To receive reports of any significant incidents of fraud or financial impropriety and actions taken to enhance controls where this is considered necessary.

#### **External Audit**

- To consider the external auditor's annual letter, relevant reports, and the report to those charged with governance.
- To consider specific reports as agreed with the external auditors.
- To comment on the scope and depth of external audit work and to ensure it gives value for money.

#### Financial Reporting

- To review the annual statement of accounts. Specifically, to consider whether appropriate
  accounting policies have been followed and whether there are concerns arising from the
  financial statements or from the audit that need to be brought to the attention of the
  Council.
- To consider the external auditor's report to those charged with governance on issues arising from the audit of the accounts.
- To seek assurances that the Council has complied with the Treasury Management Strategy and Practices by demonstrating effective control of the associated risks and pursuing optimum performance consistent with those risks.

#### Accountability Arrangements

- To report to Council on the Committee's findings, conclusions and recommendations concerning the adequacy and effectiveness of the governance, risk management and internal control frameworks.
- To raise the profile of probity generally within the Council and to report on matters of concern to the individual Cabinet Member, relevant Scrutiny Committee, Cabinet or to Council as necessary and appropriate.
- To work in synergy with the five Scrutiny Committees of the Council and liaise with other Council Committees as and when appropriate to avoid duplication in work programmes.

### **Training & Development**

 To attend relevant training session in accordance with the Member Development Programme including specialist training tailored for Members of the Audit Committee e.g. treasury management.

### 3. Our Work in 2015/16

The Audit Committee's activities have been designed to provide assurance to the Council and to make a positive contribution towards improving the governance arrangements across the Council.

Effective Audit Committees can bring many benefits to Local Authorities including:

- increasing public confidence in the objectivity and fairness of financial and other reporting;
- providing additional assurance on the robustness of the Authority's arrangements through a process of independent and objective review;
- raising awareness of the need for internal control and the implementation of audit recommendations, thereby reinforcing the importance and independence of internal and external audit;
- being a platform for Elected Members to bring matters of financial, governance, risk and internal control for consideration and action as necessary.

The work of the Audit Committee can be split into two: the Committee receives regular reports in relation to the standard agenda themes, and also receives ad-hoc / non- standard reports based on risk, governance or internal control issues. Each of these aspects is reported on below.

### 4. Standard Items

### 4.1 Finance

The Corporate Director Resources (Section 151 Officer) has provided financial updates at every meeting outlining the budget strategy and the Council's overall financial position, to provide Committee Members with an overview of the financial standing of the Council. This allows for a regular opportunity to raise questions on the budget and general finance matters during a period of ongoing unprecedented financial pressure. Monitoring the financial position with regards to achieving the necessary savings in some directorates has proved difficult, due to ongoing overspends. The year-end out-turn report will be important to provide assurance on a "balanced" budget.

The Audit Committee Chair has written to the Chief Executive this year, requesting an increase in the level of rigour placed on the identification and allocation of Directorate savings. Assurance on the due process has been provided by the Section 151 Officer.

This year saw a new risk added to the Corporate Risk Register relating to Financial Resilience and the Corporate Director Resources (Section 151 Officer) has provided regular updates on this and agreed to continue to do so at future meetings.

Much work has gone into preparing the Budget Strategy for 2016/17 and the medium term, which was approved by Cabinet and Council in July 2015. The Corporate Director Resources has outlined the process involved and assured Audit Committee that robust due diligence and scrutiny of 2016/17 proposals has been undertaken through the updated budget strategy approach which was introduced in 2015/16 in consideration of the future shape of the Council.

On 22 June 2015, the Committee was given opportunity to review and provide comments on the 2014/15 draft Statement of Accounts, prior to them being signed by the Corporate Director Resources and subsequently submitted for external audit and public inspection. On 16 September 2015 the Wales Audit Office reported to Committee that they were issuing an

unqualified audit opinion. Officers were congratulated on completing a very comprehensive and complex piece of work within the required timescale.

### 4.2 Governance, Risk Management & Internal Control

The Audit Committee has formed a view on the Council's governance, risk management and internal control arrangements taking into account the information presented by the Corporate Director Resources (Section 151 Officer), the External Auditor – Wales Audit Office (WAO), the Audit & Risk Manager and other officers of the Council.

The Annual Governance Statement (AGS) is a fundamental governance document which the Audit Committee plays a key role in contributing to and challenging. During the municipal year 2015/16 the AGS was considered by the Audit Committee, in conjunction with the draft Statement of Accounts for 2014/15, in June and September.

The Committee has had early involvement with the draft AGS 2015/16. In February 2016 Audit Committee was provided with a report on the process in place for compiling the AGS, inclusive of an update on the senior management assurance process. In March 2016, Audit Committee was provided with the opportunity to comment on the draft AGS.

Levels of assurance from a number of sources have been incorporated into the AGS in reporting on the Council's governance arrangements. A Governance and Member Engagement Programme Board, comprising officers throughout the Resources and Governance and Legal Services Directorates has contributed to producing the AGS.

The revised senior management structure took effect in June 2015, and Audit Committee has engaged with each Director since their appointment. Audit Committee has continued to receive update reports biannually on the corporate risk register and senior management assurance statement responses.

The Audit Committee has received the analysis of a benchmarking exercise with UK Core Cities which identified the broad alignment of Cardiff Council's corporate risk register with those in other Core Cities. This has provided assurance on the content of the corporate risk register and the risk management focus at a time when its composition has been relatively static.

In November 2015, Audit Committee received a briefing on the senior management exercise undertaken in order to inform the development and formalisation of a corporate risk appetite by Cabinet. At a time when difficult strategic decisions need to be made there is a need to accept a level of risk which is acceptable to the Council, and within tolerance. The Audit Committee will monitor the progress in formalising this approach and embedding risk appetite considerations in decision making.

The Audit Committee has received a report on the expanded use of senior management assurance statements in order to support the AGS, by engaging the assurance of the Chief Executive in addition to each Director at the year end. This provides more comprehensive assurance which now represents the full management team.

The Audit Committee have also recognised the work undertaken within Internal Audit to create an assurance "map", gathering information from a wide range of reports and studies undertaken from both inside and outside the Council, applying the "three lines of defence "approach.

### 4.3 Treasury Management

This is an area where Committee Members have a specific role to fulfil, as set out in the Treasury Management Strategy approved by the Council.

Over the past twelve months the Committee has received reports on the Treasury Management Annual Report, Mid-Year Report 2015/16, Treasury Management Strategy 2016-17 and the Treasury Performance Report.

This has given Members the opportunity to scrutinise and challenge the approach adopted and decisions taken. This is a complex area, and the Committee believes that it has added value by probing and scrutinising policies and the data provided in conjunction with Officers.

The Committee is satisfied with the way in which the Council is currently undertaking its Treasury Management responsibilities, but has emphasised the need to ensure a spread of debt repayments. At the Mid-Year position, it was reported that the maturity of debt profile has improved with a stable projection to 2056.

The Committee has been provided with an update on the Treasury Management position in each Committee meeting, but has previously expressed an interest in receiving further benchmarking data on treasury management activities with comparable Councils. The Council has subsequently become part of the Capita Benchmarking Club, which it is anticipated will enable meaningful comparisons. Benchmarking has also been carried out to compare the Council's level of debt with the Public Works Loan Board, from which in June 2015 we are assured that of other local authorities the Council's average rate of debt was below the Welsh average.

Audit Committee updates have been provided on borrowing in relation to the Housing Revenue Account settlement payment, and the final details of the settlement payment made to exit the Housing Revenue Account Subsidy (HRAS) system.

### 4.4 External Audit (Wales Audit Office)

The Committee places reliance on the work of the Wales Audit Office (WAO) as the Council's external auditors.

The Committee has received key documents throughout the year such as the Regulatory Programme; Audit of Financial Statements Report; Audit Plan; Annual Financial Audit Outline (including the Cardiff & Vale Pension Fund Audit Plan) and in September 2015 the WAO's Annual Improvement Report.

An arrangement has been set up for Members of the WAO team to be present at each meeting in order to engage with members on key report findings and on the progress and timetable of forthcoming reports.

In February 2016 WAO issued the Corporate Assessment Follow On of the Council. The followon assessment reviewed the extent to which the Council was effectively addressing the issues raised in the Corporate Assessment in September 2014.

The follow-on review concluded that 'The Council has put in place better arrangements to support improvement and to address longstanding issues, but is now at a critical point in embedding them if it is to achieve a step change in delivering improved outcomes.'

The positive steps which have been made by the Council should be commended, but there is a need to avoid complacency and ensure that the recommendations and proposals for improvement are promptly and effectively acted upon.

Audit Committee Members receive a number of other reports and studies from WAO. These reports are of interest, but often present broad national or regional findings and conclusions. Each report / study is considered and any lessons learned are reported separately to Audit Committee and officers asked to attend to provide assurance any findings will be acted upon in the best interest of the Council. There have been three such reports /studies during 2015-16.

#### 4.5 Internal Audit

Similar to the External Audit arrangements, the Committee places reliance on the work of the Council's in-house Internal Audit Team. Throughout the year the Committee gained assurances from considering the following key documents:

- Internal Audit Strategy (including Internal Audit Charter)
- Internal Audit Plans
- Internal Audit Quarterly Progress Reports
- Internal Audit Executive Summaries
- Internal Audit Annual Report
- Value for money Studies
- Changes to key documents / policies.

The Committee welcomed the information presented by the Audit & Risk Manager to gain a level of assurance on the Council's internal control environment.

The Committee has played a key role in supporting and promoting the Internal Audit function as well as engaging with officers; approving plans and policies; and helping to shape new and innovative processes.

The Audit Committee has been provided with an overview of all audit reports issued but emphasis has been on those audits where "Limited assurance" audit opinions have been reported and in seeking assurance around improvement, through implementing audit recommendations. The level of "Limited assurance" opinions has slightly increased on last year (22 to date + 6 on hold) which requires careful monitoring, but encouragingly the outcomes from follow up audits are much improved on previous years.

Members have welcomed a new protocol introduced this year so that every "Limited assurance" report is now shared with the Chief Executive and Section 151 Officer, which enables the Committee to focus on area where there are significant control weaknesses i.e. "No assurance" audit opinion reported, and where follow up audits have failed to evidence satisfactory improvement to the internal control environment.

Further detail on some outcomes from the work of the Internal Audit Team is shown later in the section 'Non-Standard Reports to the Audit Committee' and the Committee will receive a full year overview of audit work completed, and key messages, when the Internal Audit Annual Report is presented to the June 2016 meeting of the Audit Committee. This report will provide the Audit Manager's opinion on the Council's overall position in relation to risk, governance and internal control, based on the work undertaken by the Internal Audit team.

### 5. Non-Standard Reports to the Audit Committee

The Committee received a number of reports throughout 2015/16 which were not standard items. Details of these reports are given below:

### 5.1 Education & Lifelong Learning

Glyn Derw and Michaelston Federation - The Committee considered an Executive Summary Report on Glyn Derw and Michaelston Federation in February 2016. This audit highlighted a wide range of concerns around governance and financial control which were discussed with the Director. Audit Committee has been advised that a new business manager has taken up post and has been working with staff and provided with additional support from the LFM Manager to address concerns. Audit Committee has expressed concern about financial accountability and governance prior to the establishment of a new school and this will be included in the follow up Internal Audit review.

Youth Centre Inventories - The Audit Committee was provided with an Internal Audit briefing which outlined how improvements identified in an audit of Youth Centres Inventories in 2013 had not been sustained. Consequently 'No Assurance' could be given on the management of assets in the centres. Meetings have been held with the Director and appropriate Managers with regard to the report, and it has been agreed that the audit findings will be considered as part of any changes to the youth service in the coming months. A follow up audit will be undertaken in six months to ensure that controls have been appropriately enhanced.

Annual Report on School Governance and Deficit - The Committee received a position statement on schools in deficit at its meeting on 22.06.15. Although there did not appear to be timescales for the schools to bring their budgets out of deficit, the Committee was advised that there are only a small number of schools that continue to cause concern to the authority. It has also been reported that there has been an increase in performance management in schools with some good changes in leadership, which includes financial management. There are cases where excess balances have not reduced over the last four years, however, the Committee was advised that most of these balances would be reduced in setting school budgets for 2015/16. The Committee will continue to receive information on schools balances as part of the Director of Education & Life Long Learning's report on governance in schools.

### 5.2 City Operations

<u>Highways Street Operations</u> – In June 2015, the Director of City Operations (formerly Strategic Planning, Highways & Traffic & Transport) provided Audit Committee with a response to an internal audit report which raised a number of concerns including monitoring of staff activity, hours worked and use of vehicles. Improvements were reported with a commitment to change through the appointment of new works managers and a team leader, and the introduction of several initiatives to improve efficiency. Internal audit will assess the progression of these initiatives and review the progress in implementing audit recommendations raised in a forthcoming follow-up review which is scheduled for the first guarter of 2016/17.

### 5.3 Communities, Housing & Customer Services

<u>Building Maintenance Framework Contract</u> – Audit Committee Members have raised a number of concerns about work quality, cost effectiveness and operational matters in relation to the Building Maintenance Framework. Assurances have been sought through a number of information streams, including the commissioned independent review of the framework by Constructing Excellence Wales (CEW) and the presence of a Principal Auditor on a Building

Maintenance Project Board, which has developed a series of actions and targets in order to meet the objectives of the CEW recommendations.

In November 2015, Audit Committee received a presentation on the Building Maintenance Framework from the Assistant Director Housing and Communities, Senior Category Manager, Commissioning & Procurement and OMs in Facilities Management and Community Maintenance Services. The presentation provided Committee with a briefing on key features of the Building Maintenance Framework Agreement, the remit of CEW Review and a summary of the findings and action plan.

Members welcomed the detailed briefing on this area and a number of matters were raised which included in particular:

- the need for better communication of the policies and processes with Elected Members;
- the need for a focussed single Council delivery approach to provide best use of resources and improved monitoring, customer service and satisfaction;
- the need to ensure effective use of Council resources, value for money in parallel to effectiveness and efficiencies of current framework;
- the need to learn from current framework contract arrangements;
- the importance of a robust process for complaints; their review; and consideration be given to a quality assurance report for tenants / clients to complete and return (aimed at providing the more vulnerable people with a greater opportunity to comment on work done and quality issues);
- the Asset Management group continue to monitor the implementation of the recommendations arising from the CEW report.

#### 5.4 Internal Audit

<u>Measuring Effectiveness of Internal Audit</u> – This year the Audit & Risk Manager has presented details of work undertaken as part of the Quality Assurance and Improvement Programme used to measure the effectiveness of internal audit in relation to the following different elements:

- Delivery against the Audit Plan;
- Delivery against Annual Objectives;
- Internal quality assurance reviews;
- Extent to which audit recommendations are agreed and implemented;
- · Director meetings and audit assurance questionnaires;
- Public Sector Internal Audit Standards self assessment;
- Institute of Internal Auditors "What Every Director Should Know "self-assessment;
- Audit Committee view as part of Audit Committee Self-Assessment;
- Benchmarking;
- External Assessment;
- Wales Audit Office opinion on Internal Audit and overall financial control opinion;
- Management Performance Review.

Audit Committee welcomed the report and commended the team on its robust audit work against a reducing level of resources. The client feedback has showed that the effectiveness; professionalism and understanding of the audit function have been high.

<u>Assurance Mapping</u> - The Committee has received a report from the Audit and Risk Manager on the development of an Assurance framework which is being used to review the Council's internal control environment. The assurance map begins with the contents of the corporate risk register, senior management assurance statements and significant governance issues arising from the annual governance statement. The outputs of different sources of assurance are populated on the assurance map, utilising a three lines of defence model. This model considers

the assurance gained from management / internal controls, inspection / regulatory / compliance activities and the work of external audit.

During a time of limited audit resources, with a strong ongoing need for audit assurance, the assurance map considers the work of others in providing assurance in relation to governance, risk and internal control matters. This is used to shape Internal Audit priorities and impact on the work and timing of the Internal Audit Team, to avoid duplication and ease pressure on Directorates, who may be subject to both internal and external assurance reviews.

Public Sector Internal Audit Standards - The Audit and Risk manager has provided an update on the Public Sector Internal Audit Standards (PSIAS) which were adopted in April 2013. The PSIAS have a number of requirements, including the requirement for an external assessment at least once every five years. The Welsh Chief Auditor's group are proposing that all Welsh authorities establish a joint peer group to undertake such assessments. This approach is consistent with a peer group established for Core cities across the UK, being based around a robust self-assessment and an external evaluation that fully meets the requirements of the Standard, whilst being cost effective. The Audit Committee has approved the above approach to carrying out external assessments in compliance with Public Sector Internal Audit Standards (PSIAS). In readiness for the external assessment, an Internal Audit Self-Assessment has been completed and has produced improvement actions which are being progressed.

<u>Internal Audit Management</u> – In February 2016, Members received a report on the amended management arrangements for Internal Audit.

Following the appointment of a Head of Finance in September 2015, a review was undertaken to consider the overall management structure in Finance, including suitable arrangements for the Internal Audit functions.

With the Audit & Risk Manager retiring at the end of March 2015, after 45 years in local government, primarily working within Internal Audit, a decision was taken to appoint a new Audit Manager with a focus on the core roles of Audit and Investigation services. The retiring Audit & Risk Manager had been instrumental in the development of the Audit Committee since 2003, when the first Audit Panel was established, and continued to provide technical support and reports to every meeting since then.

Members have been keen to ensure a seamless transition and the appointment of a new Audit Manager who offers effective leadership and direction to the Audit teams and a professional service in supporting the work of the Audit Committee. There has been a temporary period where the Audit Manger role has been facilitated by the Head of Finance, during a period where the post has been advertised. This arrangement will continue until a suitable appointment is made.

<u>Risk Management Assurance</u> – The retirement of the Audit and Risk Manager has provided an opportunity to allocate risk management responsibilities to a senior officer who is outside of the Internal Audit function. This serves to reduce any perceived impairment to objectivity or independence in risk management activities. It also enables the Internal Audit Team to focus audit resources on risk management assurance, with a reduction in risk management coordination requirements.

<u>Value for Money Studies (VFM)</u> - The Internal Audit Team has produced a number of value for money (VFM) studies which have been welcomed by the Audit Committee. Committee has been provided with VFM briefings on Agency Spend, Standby Payments, Annual Leave, Overtime, Home to Office Travel, and Mileage Claims and each report has presented potential

opportunities for management to realise efficiencies and reduce costs. The Audit and Risk Manager has sought assurances on the appropriateness of spend and asked Directors to identify and consider potential areas for savings. In addition to efficiency based concerns, some compliance and control issues were highlighted through these studies which Directors have been asked to address. Audit Committee will continue to monitor the results of value for money briefings received and seek assurances that progress is being made to improve processes and practices.

### 5.5 Scrutiny Services

<u>Audit / Scrutiny Protocol</u> - The Audit Committee Members and Council Officers have collaborated with the Policy, Review and Performance (PRAP) Scrutiny Committee to create a draft protocol between our respective Committees. The protocol ensures roles and responsibilities are clearly defined, work planning is complementary and that any potential work duplications are avoided. It is supported by clearly defined areas of responsibility and processes to share work programmes, information and certain reports. It is anticipated that the report can be finalised once the terms of reference of each Committee have been approved for the municipal year 2016/17.

### 6. Audit Committee Self-Assessment

On 19 January 2015 a workshop was held prior to the meeting of the Audit Committee to undertake a Self-Assessment exercise. On 23 March 2015 the outcomes were summarised and reported back to the Committee for approval.

At the Audit Committee meeting in on 1 February 2016, the Audit and Risk Manager provided an updated assessment, following a review of the current position relating to the sixteen improvement actions from the January 2015 Self-Assessment. The follow-up review showed that most of the actions had been implemented, with two actions contingent on the finalisation of a Scrutiny and Audit Protocol. This protocol has been drafted and discussed with only minor amendments anticipated before it can be approved.

The follow-up assessment is appended to this Annexe 1, and the next full Self-Assessment exercise is scheduled for September 2016.

### 7. Key Observations 2015/16

With the support of the Wales Audit Office, Internal Audit and other Council officers, a Work Programme was developed setting out the priorities for the twelve months. This centred on the significant risks and significant challenges facing the Council. The work of the Wales Audit Office and the Internal Audit Section has been helpful in providing assurance to the Committee on key areas.

The Committee have concentrated on areas considered to be high profile and / or high risk within the Council, and have met officers responsible for various aspects of service delivery. This has enhanced the Committee's understanding of the services they provide and the challenges that they face. In addition, the Committee has had the opportunity to challenge and discuss actions taken in response to both External and Internal Audit Reports. It is recognised that the Council has continued to face severe financial challenges and strives to look for efficiencies and service delivery initiatives. It is therefore vital that good governance is

maintained. The Committee will continue to support the Council as it responds to these challenges.

### 8. Opinion of the Audit Committee for 2015/16

At the strategic level, based on the evidence presented to the Audit Committee during 2015/16, it is the considered view of the Committee that the Council does, for the most part, have sound financial controls and governance arrangements in place. Strategic risks are well captured and reviewed on a regular basis and these represent the true challenges facing the Council at the present time. Examples of where the Committee has continuing concerns, which will be incorporated into the Committee's Work Programme for 2016/17, include:

### 8.1 Organisational Development Programme

The Organisational Development Programme (ODP) has been discussed at Audit Committee meetings in 2015/16. This is with the clear recognition that delivery against the Organisational Development Plan is being monitored and challenged by other Committees (namely the Policy Review and Performance Scrutiny Committee).

Although some assurance can be placed on the work of Scrutiny, the Audit Committee has expressly noted that the importance of this programme of work for the Council on its improvement journey. The programme has a key role in moving the Council towards its new shape and is acknowledged as a critical savings enabler.

At a time when Audit Committee has continued to challenge the budget position when faced with unprecedented financial pressure, the recently issued Corporate Assessment Follow On report from the Wales Audit Office has highlighted a need for a clear link between Medium Term Financial Plan savings plans and work streams or projects in the ODP.

Audit Committee will reflect on the comments raised by the Wales Office, and will seek assurance from relevant management and through the work of Internal Audit, that the ODP is clearly aligned to and monitored against critical business objectives. In the forthcoming year, Audit Committee intends to invite the Leader and Chief Executive to attend and answer questions related to the Corporate Assessment Follow On.

In recognising the critical importance of the ODP to the Council, Internal Audit has initiated a Control Risk Self-Assessment (CRSA) approach to auditing an initial pilot of ODP projects and regular engagement with Management in the OD Team. Audit Committee anticipates the findings of Internal Audit and the ongoing assurance from the roll-out of the audit approach throughout 2016/17.

#### 8.2 Financial / Internal Control

The continuing reduction in resources, together with a growing population and greater demand for public services, mean that the Council is facing significant challenges in how it delivers services in the future. The Committee continues to receive regular updates from the Corporate Director Resources and other senior managers to seek assurances around governance and fundamental financial control.

Audit Committee receives regular reports in respect of the budget, treasury management and financial resilience. A key enabler for meeting severe financial pressures is reforming and redesigning services. There is a clear need to ensure strong internal controls are integrated within new or reformed processes and systems. At a time when many decisions have to be

finance driven it is essential that internal controls are not neglected or impaired in the use of public monies.

Over 2015/16 there has been an increase in limited or no assurance audit reports from the Internal Audit Section. This is a concern that will require regular review by the Audit Committee, particularly when some isolated functions have repeatedly failed to maintain the required standards of internal control. The number of such reports is not yet at a level of significant concern, but the trend of limited assurance being reported has captured the attention of the Audit Committee. In instances where improvements are not promptly made we will be inviting those accountable to attend Audit Committee and explain the reasons for control weaknesses and to provide a firm commitment to improvement. This is with strong support and commitment from the Chief Executive to support management and the Audit Committee in driving improvements.

#### 8.3 Contract and Procurement Matters

Through a number of Internal Audits completed this year a consistent weakness has been contract management and performance monitoring. Some areas of the Council such as Social Services rely heavily on commissioned services for certain aspects of their services and spend a significant amount of money on this purpose. Internal Audit reports are regularly reporting limitations to assurance on the basis of a lack of clear contracts for high value spend and instances of lapsed contracts, in addition to weaknesses in contract management where contracts are in place.

The Building Maintenance Framework contract involves a significant amount of spending with a limited number of contractors for services under different lots. For some time, Audit Committee members have identified and raised concerns about the cost effectiveness and quality of work carried out by contractors within the current Framework. This has been based on Member observations of elderly and/or vulnerable tenants receiving substandard work or delays from contractors and sub-contractors. Some of these delays have been significant i.e. for weeks if not months. Many Members have also reported poor communication and situations where tenants have been left waiting in their homes all day for services which were not received when arranged.

Members have sought assurances that the quality of the work would be monitored more closely in future and welcomed the commissioning of the independent review by Constructing Excellence Wales (CEW). Far from being dismissive of concerns, the report echoed members' concerns and made a series of recommendations such as a Building Maintenance Project Board, which includes a Principal Auditor, to develop a series of actions and targets to address all the highlighted issues.

A presentation by the Assistant Director Housing and Communities and the Senior Category Manager (commissioning and Procurement) was made on the Building Maintenance Framework in November 2015 and the reasoning behind the five contract categories explained. With the help of OMs in Facilities Management and Community Maintenance, the Committee received a detailed explanation of the CEW remit, its findings and the resulting action plan.

Members have raised observations and the expectation that updated processes and standardisation will ensure effective management of contractor performance. This needs to be enabled through embedding clear and accessible processes to raise concerns, issues or feedback which are consistently and transparently managed and responded to in a timely manner. Improvements are needed in monitoring and accountability to ensure that quality, time and cost issues are identified and rectified promptly, with lessons learnt from the existing framework and external (CEW) review and with contractors held to account for substandard

performance through enactment of contractual terms and clauses. Members have welcomed the introduction of 'mini-tendering' within each five categories as a means of introducing competition and hopefully value for money within the Framework arrangements.

The Audit Committee is seeking greater engagement with the Building Maintenance Framework Programme Board and such arrangements for the clear communication of concerns and also demonstration and assurance of progress made by the Board have been initiated following the year end.

The commissioning of the CEW review represents positive steps in seeking to improve contract management processes, but on a Council-wide basis there are areas where significant amounts of money are being spent without clear contracts, or where contracts are not being sufficiently monitored and managed. This is a finding which is consistently being reported.

At a time when the Council is moving towards new models of service delivery Audit Committee will continue to seek assurances that improvements are being made to contract management on a Council-wide basis. Audit Committee will continue to monitor the findings of Internal Audit reports and the progress of the Building Maintenance Framework Project Board.

### 8.4 Schools Governance & Compliance

Audit Committee has continued to raise concerns about governance and compliance matters in schools. Historically, Audit Committee has received a greater proportion of 'Limited Assurance' audit reports in relation to schools, compared to the rest of the Authority. This trend has not improved in 2015/16, with Internal Audit opinions of both 'Limited Assurance' and 'No Assurance' issued to Cardiff schools this year. Particular concerns and details have been discussed in Audit Committee meetings, together with relevant management responses.

The Committee acknowledges that the Council is not able to set rules for schools to adhere to regarding contracting matters, albeit advice can be offered on good practice. Although practices can only be commended, given the size of school budgets and the reputational risks associated with weaknesses in school governance, this area of interest remains a priority of the Audit Committee. The Audit Committee continues to support the production and commending of best practice guidance to schools in the interests of strengthening financial control.

Effective financial management is another important element of governance in schools. Audit Committee has received a position statement on schools in deficit in June 2015. The Committee was advised that there are only a small number of schools that continue to cause concern to the authority. The Committee will continue to receive information on schools balances as part of the Director of Education & Life Long learning's report on governance in schools.

#### 8.5 Internal Audit Resources

The financial challenges facing the Authority are having an impact across all services resulting in the reduction of resources. The Internal Audit section like others has seen a significant reduction in the number of staff in recent years, and a loss of experienced officers. Reliance is placed on the Internal Audit team to provide assurance to the Section 151 Officer and senior management on the key controls in place across the Authority.

The Audit Committee has continued to express concern about the reducing number of audit staff, requesting that this is expressly stated in the Annual Governance Statement 15/16. Audit Committee members have also questioned if Internal Audit has sufficient resource to discharge its responsibility. The Head of Finance has assured the Audit Committee that although resourcing concerns are valid, post reductions in Internal Audit have not related to its core

function. The Audit Committee will continue to require details of the Internal Audit resources available relative to its required activities, and the management of staffing limitations and risks though the Audit Manager's quarterly progress reports.

At a time of financial pressure and significant change, with lots of officers leaving who have many years of experience, it is considered vital that a strong audit presence is maintained.

### 9. Looking ahead to 2016/17

During the forthcoming municipal year the Committee will continue to be guided by the Corporate Director Resources, External and Internal Audit teams.

Audit Committee will seek to further develop the assurances relative to our remit and will continue to contribute to an effective control framework. The Committee will monitor the issues highlighted in the 'Opinion of the Audit Committee 2015/16' contained within this report ensuring these are incorporated within the Committee's programme of work.

Audit Committee has a keen interest in appointment of the new Audit Manager, who will not have the responsibilities for risk which were held by the retiring Audit and Risk Manager. This provides an opportunity to separate out any perceived independence and objectivity issues with the coordination role being removed from the Internal Audit Section.

With risk management being a key activity in our terms of reference, we will be seeking assurance that new structures for risk management and control are robust, and will look to the Internal Audit team to provide independent assurance to Audit Committee on their effectiveness.

Additionally, Audit Committee will keep a watching brief on the development of the Local Government (Wales) Bill. Any required measures will be put in place to ensure that the Committee is well placed to discharge all responsibilities effectively resulting from the widening of its responsibilities which result from the bill.

The Committee's Work Programme will continue to be reviewed to ensure the Committee maximises its contribution to the governance and control framework, at the same time managing agendas to ensure that all meetings are equally productive and focus on the key issues.

### 10. Audit Committee Membership 2015/16

The Committee consists of four Independent Lay Members (sought by public advertisement) and eight Non Executive Councillors, elected by Council, see Annex 2 for details. Independent members are appointed for no more than two administrative terms with Council Members reappointed annually.

The Committee is serviced by Council Officers, principally the Corporate Director Resources (Section 151 Officer) and the Audit & Risk Manager. Representatives from the Wales Audit Office have attended three of the four (to date) meetings.

The Audit Committee met on 5 occasions throughout the municipal period 2015/16 on the following dates: 22 June 2015, 16 September 2015, 30 November 2015, 01 February 2016 and 22 March 2016.

### 11. Attendance in 2015/16

#### Attendance 2015/16 Possible Actual

Attendance 2015/16	Possible	Actual				
Independent Lay Membe	ers					
lan Arundale (Chairperson)	4	3				
Professor Maurice Pendlebury (Deputy Chairperson)	4	4				
Sir Jon Shortridge	2	1				
Hugh Thomas	4	2				
Non Executive Councillors						
Councillor Nigel Howells	4	4				
Councillor Bill Kelloway	2	2				
Councillor Mary McGarry	4	3				
Councillor Paul Mitchell	4	3				
Councillor Jim Murphy	4	4				
Councillor Dianne Rees	4	3				
Councillor Christopher Weaver	4	4				

During 2015/16 the Committee experienced a number of changes in membership; Sir Jon Shortridge stepped down from the Committee in September, following his extensive experience as the Chair of the Audit Committee, and former Audit Panel of the City of Cardiff Council.

Councillor Walker took up his new role as Lord Mayor, and subsequently left the Committee in May 2015. Councillor Robson left in June, following a change in political party and was replaced by Councillor Kelloway, who has previously served on the Audit Committee.

Councillors, Dianne Rees and Eleanor Sanders, joined the Committee following Annual Council in May 2015, however, shortly after, Councillor Sanders stepped down.

Induction training was provided to Councillors Rees and Murphy. The Audit & Risk Manager provided an overview of the Committee's remit in line with the Committee's Terms of Reference, governance, risk management and internal control. The Operational Manager, Capital & Treasury, provided specialist training around the Committee's role with regards to Treasury Management.

There have been two vacancies on the Committee this year; one Lay member position has been vacant since June.

# 11. Audit Committee Contacts

Ian Arundale Chairperson of Audit Committee	arundale@btinternet.com
Christine Salter Corporate Director Resources	029 2087 2301 C.Salter@cardiff.gov.uk
Audit Manager (Vacant)	029 2087 2248
Ann-Marie Harkin Engagement Director, Wales Audit Office	029 2032 0562 info@wao.gov.uk
Janet McNicholas Manager, Wales Audit Office	029 2087 2259 info@wao.gov.uk
Non Jenkins Manager, Wales Audit Office	07879 848671 info@wao.gov.uk
Chris Pugh Performance Audit Lead, Wales Audit Office	029 2032 0523   07748 181685 info@wao.gov.uk

# **Annex 1** Self-Assessment: Improvement Actions – Updated Position (February 2016)

Ref.	Proposed Improvement Actions	Target Date	Action Owner	February 2016 Position	February 2016 Status
	Roles & Responsibilities				
1	Audit Committee Terms of Reference  Officers to undertake a review of the Committee's Terms of Reference prior to Annual Council in May 2015 to ensure fit for purpose and in line with current best practice.	May 2015	Audit & Risk Manager	The Audit Committee Terms of Reference was reviewed and approved in May 2015.	Actioned.
	Volume of Meeting Papers			To reduce the agenda size in Audit Committee meetings three new approaches have been introduced.	Actioned
2	Members noted that although the agenda supports the Work Programme there are often large volumes of paper associated with each agenda item. It can be difficult for Members to digest prior to the meeting given other demands. Officers to be reminded that the information put in front of Members to be relevant and concise and not overly detailed. Where Members of the Committee have concerns over such matters to report to the Committee Chair.	Ongoing	Corporate Director Resources & Audit & Risk Manager	<ol> <li>An Audit Committee SharePoint site has been created so that documentation of interest to the Audit Committee can be stored for Member information. This is being developed, with solutions being sought for Independent Members who are not currently able to access the SharePoint site.</li> <li>Emails are being circulated to Members for information communications, to limit Audit Committee agendas.</li> <li>Members are invited to a pre meeting of the Audit Committee giving them an opportunity to raise and discuss any issues prior to the formal meeting.</li> </ol>	
3	Information Items Items for information to be taken off the Agenda and distributed for information only.  Any ongoing actions to be reviewed and where appropriate to be reported, in brief, under Outstanding Actions (for information only.)	Ongoing	Secretariat	As above, information only items are being reduced in Audit Committee meetings.  Pre meeting allows Members with the opportunity to raise issues.	Actioned

Ref.	Proposed Improvement Actions	Target Date	Action Owner	February 2016 Position	February 2016 Status
4	Assurance Summary  The Audit Committee annually are presented with an Assurance Summary of the key governance issues and corporate risks. Members of the Committee to continue to receive this summary annually to provide a level of assurance against the Committee's Work Programme.	Annually	Audit & Risk Manager	<ul> <li>On a biannual basis, the Audit Committee receives</li> <li>An action plan of the 'Significant Governance Issues' affecting the Council, as updated by the Senior Management Team, and;</li> <li>The Corporate Risk Register (detailed and summary versions).</li> </ul>	Actioned
5	Circulation of Work Programme  The Committee's Work Programme is to be published more widely amongst elected Members similar to Scrutiny.	Ongoing	Democratic Services	Meeting papers published on the Council Website.	Ongoing
	Audit Committee & Scrutiny Committees  In order to address the issue of items being considered by Scrutiny overlapping with Audit Committee a protocol is to be developed by officers.			A draft Scrutiny and Audit Protocol has been developed to promote work synergies.  The Audit Committee Chair also attended a Scrutiny Chair's Liaison Forum in quarter two (2015/16).	Draft protocol Prepared - Ongoing
6	In order to support this notion the Audit Committee Chair would consider it beneficial to meet with the Scrutiny Chairs on an annual basis.	Ongoing	Secretariat		
	In future, Scrutiny work programmes to be shared with Audit Committee Members and used to inform Audit Committee work programme to avoid duplication.				

Ref.	Proposed Improvement Actions	Target Date	Action Owner	February 2016 Position	February 2016 Status
7	Chairperson's Letters  There have been instances where issues have been reported to the Committee on more than one occasion, where action has not been taken. In order to escalate these matters the Chair will in future write to the Chief Executive, relevant Cabinet Member or relevant Scrutiny Chair if the Director cannot provide a resolution.	Ongoing	Audit & Risk Manager	This is now happening and the Chair does raise issues with the Chief Executive, Cabinet Member or relevant Scrutiny Chair as considered appropriate.	Actioned
8	Independent Members  Engagement with Members - To benefit the independent Members an item to be included on each agenda which can be used for elected members to bring any matters of interest to the independent Members.  Members Newsletter - The newsletter circulated to elected Members to be distributed to the Independent Members.	Ongoing	Democratic Services	All Members receive induction training.  There is a pre meeting before every Audit Committee meeting, where there is an opportunity for all Members to have discussions and to bring any matters of interest to the independent members.  Being considered as to best means of sharing this. Potential to use SharePoint website once access provided to Independent members.	Actioned Ongoing
	Monitoring & Oversight				
9	Internal Audit Resource  The impact of reducing resources within the Internal Audit Team to be highlighted in the Audit Committee's Annual Report.	March 2015	Audit & Risk Manager	The impact of reducing resources within the Internal Audit Team was highlighted in the Audit Committee's Annual Report and emphasised in the Annual Governance Statement.  Regular updates to Audit Committee mention resource issues and next year's Audit Plan will highlight any resource implications on audit coverage.	Ongoing

Ref.	Proposed Improvement Actions	Target Date	Action Owner	February 2016 Position	February 2016 Status
10	Chief Executive Attendance  The Committee would appreciate if the Chief Executive would attend the Audit Committee on an annual basis to provide an update on the progress of the Organisational Development Plan and the strategic direction of the Council.	December 2015	Corporate Director Resources, Secretariat & Chief Executive	The CEO and Leader have attended Audit Committee to provide updates on the ODP and have agreed to continue to provide updates and attend as appropriate.	Actioned
11	Monitoring Officer  The Monitoring Officer to attend Audit Committee when the Annual Governance Statement is considered.	In accordance with the Work Programme	County Clerk	The Monitoring Officer now attends Audit Committee whenever a governance item is included on the Agenda. She also attends the Agenda conference meeting with the Chair.	Actioned
12	Audit Committee Self Assessment  The assessment exercise to be held on an annual basis.	January 2016	Secretariat & Audit & Risk Manager	The Audit Committee Self Assessment position will be reviewed annually. Agreed the next workshop would be held in Sept 2016.	Actioned & Ongoing
	Internal & External Audit Process				
13	Meeting with Audit Manager  A formal arrangement will be offered to Members of the Committee to meet with the Internal Audit Manager and External Auditors on an individual basis.	Commencing June 2015	Secretariat & Audit & Risk Manager & Wales Audit Office	Members are aware that this is possible. The introduction of time to get together pre Audit Committee helps raise issues of interest and retain focus during the meeting.	Actioned
14	Wales Audit Office  External Auditors to be represented at all meetings.	Ongoing	Wales Audit Office	In Place.	Actioned
	Membership				

Ref.	Proposed Improvement Actions	Target Date	Action Owner	February 2016 Position	February 2016 Status
15	Vice Chair  It was agreed that a Vice Chair should be nominated by the Committee for the municipal year and to act in the absence of the Chair.	June 2015	Audit Committee	Actioned and a Vice Chair appointed in June when the Chair was appointed. MP (independent member) for current year.	Actioned
	Meetings				
	No matters to report			N/A	N/A
	Skills & Training				
16	Individual Self Assessment  The Committee Members may wish to undertake a personal self assessment in context with the role of an Audit Committee Member which may identify gaps in knowledge and areas where training can be arranged.  The suggested framework was presented to Council in December 2013: The Wales Charter for Member Support and Development: An Introduction for Authorities. Specifically the role of a Member of an Audit Committee.	-	Chairperson, Secretariat, Corporate Director Resources & Audit & Risk Manager	This opportunity has been offered to members	Actioned

### **Annex 2 - Audit Committee Member Profiles**

### **Current Membership**



lan Arundale (Chair) (Independent Lay Member)

Ian Arundale is a self-employed Law Enforcement and Security Consultant. He was a police officer for 32 years serving in South Wales, West Mercia and Dyfed-Powys Police Forces rising to the rank of Chief Constable.

Ian was the UK lead on behalf of the Association of Chief Police Officers (ACPO) for 'Armed Policing' policy and practice and chaired the UK 'Conflict Management' portfolio.

He works internationally and has recently assisted police forces and organisations in the USA and New Zealand.

Ian holds a diploma in Applied Criminology from Cambridge University, an MSc (Econ) degree in Criminology and Criminal Justice from Cardiff University and a BA (Hons) degree in Police Studies. He is a Fulbright Fellow and a graduate of the Prime Ministers 'Top Management' programme.

In addition to his role with work with Cardiff Council, he is also a member of the Discipline Committee of the Royal College of Veterinary Surgeons and a board member of the International Law Enforcement Forum (ILEF)." He was awarded the Queens Police Medal (QPM) in 2011.



Professor Maurice Pendlebury (Independent Lay Member)

Maurice Pendlebury is a qualified accountant and until his retirement he was a professor of accounting at Cardiff Business School.

He has wide experience of many areas of management in both the public and private sectors and is the author of numerous books and articles on accounting and financial management topics.

He was a non-executive director of the Cardiff and Vale NHS Trust from April 2007 to September 2009 and he is currently a governor of a high school in Cardiff.

He was appointed as an independent member of the Audit Panel in 2010 and remained a member when the panel changed and became the current Audit Committee.



Hugh Thomas (Independent Lay Member)

Hugh Thomas, a retired Solicitor, pursued a Local Government career for forty years culminating in his being Chief Executive of Mid Glamorgan County Council (the largest local authority in Wales) for fifteen years. During this time he served as Clerk to the South Wales Police Authority and Honorary Secretary of the Assembly of Welsh Counties. He retired in 1995.

He has since chaired a number of public bodies and national voluntary organisations including those in the health and higher education sectors. He was Vice Chairman and Chair of the Audit Committee of the Wales Centre for Health. He was also a non-Executive Director of Welsh Water.

Currently, he is Chair of the Regulatory Board for Wales and one of fifteen trustees of The National Library of Wales.



Cllr Nigel Howells (Liberal Democrats)

Serving the **Adamsdown** Ward.

**Term of Office:** 03/05/2012 -

Serving on the following committees:

- Audit Committee
- Bilingual Cardiff Member Group
- Council
- Economy & Culture Scrutiny Committee
- Policy Review and Performance Scrutiny Committee (Chair)

**Outside Bodies:** 

<u>Cardiff Business Technology Centre (CBTC)</u> Local Government Association General Assembly

Serving the **Penylan** Ward.



CIIr Bill Kelloway
(Liberal Democrats)

conving and i drigitari mara.

Term of Office: 03/05/2012 – Serving on the following committees:

- Audit Committee
- Council
- Licensing Committee
- Licensing Sub Committee
- Public Protection Committee
- Public Protection Sub Committee



Cllr Mary McGarry
(Labour)

Serving the Plasnewydd Ward.

**Term of Office:** 03/05/2012 -

Serving on the following committees:

- Audit Committee
- Community & Adult Services Scrutiny Committee (Chairperson)
- Council

**Outside Bodies:** 

Cardiff Action for the Single Homeless (Huggard Centre)

**Cardiff County Club** 

Standing Advisory Council for Religious Education (SACRE)



Cllr Paul Mitchell (Labour)

Serving the Fairwater Ward.

Term of Office: 03/05/2012 -

Serving on the following committees:

- Audit Committee
- Council
- Environmental Scrutiny Committee (Chairperson)

Outside Bodies: Cardiff County Club

South Wales Intercultural Community Arts (SWICA)

Serving the **Ely** Ward.



Cllr Jim Murphy (Labour)

**Term of Office:** 03/05/2012 –

Serving on the following committees:

- Audit Committee
- Children and Young People Scrutiny Committee
- Council
- Council Appeals Committee
- Democratic Services Committee
- Licensing Committee
- Licensing Sub Committee



- Public Protection Committee
- Public Protection Sub Committee

#### **Outside Bodies:**

Cardiff & Vale of Glamorgan Community Health Council
Serving the **Pontprennau** & **Old St Mellons** Ward.



Cllr Dianne Rees (Conservative)

Term of Office: 03/05/2012 - Serving on the following committees:

- Audit Committee
- Children and Young People Scrutiny Committee
- Constitution Committee
- Council
- Council Appeals Committee



Cllr Christopher Weaver (Labour)

Serving the Cathays Ward.

Term of Office: 03/05/2012 -

Serving on the following committees:

- Audit Committee
- Council
- Economy & Culture Scrutiny Committee

Vacant - Labour Member

### Past Membership 2015-16



Sir Jon Shortridge (Independent Lay Member)

Jon Shortridge has degrees in Philosophy, Politics and Economics from Oxford University, and in Urban Design and Regional Planning from Edinburgh University.

He became Permanent Secretary of the Welsh Office in March 1999 and of the National Assembly on its creation in May 1999. In May 2007 he became Permanent Secretary of the Welsh Assembly Government. He retired in May 2008, but returned to Whitehall briefly as interim permanent secretary of DIUS (and subsequently BIS) in the summer of 2009.

He is now Chair of Community Service Volunteers, Chancellor and Chair of Glyndwr University, a board member of the Parliamentary and Health Service Ombudsman and an advisory member of the Commission for Local Government in England. He chairs the audit committees of the Parliamentary and Health Service Ombudsman and of the Local Government Ombudsman, and is a member of the audit committees of Oxford University and the Royal Society.

He is married to Diana, and has a daughter and a son. He was knighted in 2002.



**David Walker** 

Serving the **Lisvane** Ward.

**Term of Office:** 05/12 – 5/15

Serving on the following committees:

• Council



**CIIr Adrian Robson** 

Serving the **Rhiwbina** Ward.

**Term of Office:** 05/12 - 6/15

Serving on the following committees:

- Appointments Committee
- Council
- Democratic Services CommitteeGlamorgan Archives Joint Committee
- Planning Committee